Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Thursday 10 May 2018, 10am to 6pm

Venue: 10 Spring Gardens

London SW1A 2BU

Present: 1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) Present for all notes

Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair)
 Mr Mark Chapman
 Ms Susan Faulds
 Dr Mark Glover
 Mr Richard Hoddes
 Dr Mona Johnson
 Present for all notes
 Present for all notes
 Present for all notes
 Present for all notes
 Present for all notes

8. Dr Nicholas Latimer Present for notes 20 to 69

9. Mr Christopher O'Regan Present for all notes 10. Professor Stephen Palmer Present for all notes 11. Dr Stephen Smith Present for all notes 12. Mr William Turner Present for all notes 13. Professor Nicky Welton Present for all notes 14. Mr Nigel Westwood Present for all notes 15. Professor Sarah Wild Present for all notes 16. Dr Stuart Williams Present for all notes

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen Programme Director, Present for all notes

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence

Melinda Goodall Associate Director, Present for all notes

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence

Jeremy Powell Project Manager, Present for all notes

National Institute for Health and Care

Excellence

Sandra Aleknavice Administrator, National Present for all notes

Institute for Health and

Care Excellence

Thomas Strong Technical Analyst, Present for notes 1 to 32

National Institute for

	Health and Care Excellence	
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 32
Alan Lamb	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 32
Mary Hughes	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 33 to 45
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 33 to 56
Sharlene Ting	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 46 to 56
Jessica Maloney	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 57 to 69
Frances Nixon	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 57 to 69
Ms Angela Stainthorpe	Research Associate, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRiG)	Present for notes 1 to 17
Mr Tosin Lambe	Research Associate, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRiG)	Present for notes 1 to 17
Mr Nigel Fleeman	Research Associate, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRiG)	Present for notes 1 to 17
Dr James Larkin	Consultant Medical Oncologist, Royal Marsden NHS Foundation Trust, clinical expert nominated by BMS	Present for notes 6 to 15
	2.110	D 0 140

Dr Philip Savage	Consultant Medical Oncologist, Brighton and Sussex University Hospitals, clinical expert nominated by Kidney	Present for notes 6 to 15 and for notes 20 to 28
Mrs Lucy Willingale	Cancer UK Patient information and support lead, Kidney Cancer UK, patient expert nominated by Kidney Cancer UK	Present for notes 6 to 15 and for notes 20 to 28
Professor Peter Clark	Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF	Present for notes 1 to 45
Dr Jonathan Shepherd	Principal Research Fellow, Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 20 to 30
Professor Joanne Lord	Director and Professorial Fellow, Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 20 to 30 and for notes 46 to 54
Mr Olu Onyimadu	Senior Research Assistant, Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 20 to 30
Dr Miriam Brazzelli	Senior Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 33 to 43
Dr Ewen Cummins	Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 33 to 43
Professor Noel Clarke	Professor of Urological Oncology, The Christie and Salford Royal Hospitals, Manchester, clinical expert nominated by the British Association of Urological Surgeons	Present for notes 33 to 41
Professor Nicholas James	Professor of Clinical Oncology, University Hospitals Birmingham NHS Foundation Trust, clinical expert nominated by Janssen	Present for notes 33 to 41
Dr Julia Murray	Consultant Clinical Oncologist, The Royal Marsden NHS Foundation Trust, clinical expert nominated by the British Uro-Oncology Group	Present for notes 33 to 41
Ms Emma Craske	Specialist Nurse, Prostate Cancer UK, patient expert nominated by Prostate Cancer UK	Present for notes 33 to 41

Mr Brian Davies Patient expert, Present for notes 33 to 41 nominated by Prostate Cancer UK Dr Graham Scotland Senior Research Fellow. Present for notes 46 to 54 Aberdeen HTA Group Research Fellow. Dr Rodolfo Hernandez Present for notes 57 to 67 Aberdeen HTA Group Dr Geoff Frampton Senior Research Fellow, Present for notes 57 to 67 Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre

Non-public attendees:

	Chair, NICE Medical Technologies Advisory	Present for all notes
Peter Groves	Committee	
	NIHR Innovation	Present for all notes
Therese Casanova	Observatory	
	NIHR Innovation	Present for all notes
Sarah Khan	Observatory	
Helen Barnett	Medical Editor, NICE	Present for all notes
Emily Crowe	Technical Adviser. NICE	Present for notes 46 to 56
Ross Dent	Technical Adviser, NICE	Present for notes 33 to 45
Melinda Goodall	Associate Director,	Present for all notes
	Public Involvement	Present for all notes
	Programme Adviser,	
Heidi Livingstone	NICE	
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, NICE	Present for all notes

Notes

Welcome

- 1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182], cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208], abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945], dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048] and ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
- 2. The Chair welcomed Dr Mona Johnson and Professor Sarah Wild to their first meeting as a member of the Appraisal Committee
- 3. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Peter Groves, Therese Casanova, Sarah Khan, Helen Barnett, Emily Crowe, Ross Dent, Melinda Goodall, Heidi Livingstone, Edgar Masanga and Irina Voicechovskaja.
- 4. Apologies were received from Mr Diar Fattah, Professor John Cairns, and Dr Sanjay Kinra.

Any other Business

5. The Committee were given an update on the progress of other appraisals previously seen by the Committee and an update on personnel changes within the NICE Technology Appraisals team.

Notes from the last meeting

6. The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting held on 6 March 2018.

Appraisal of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182]

Part 2 - Closed session

- 7. The Chair informed all attendees that this appraisal would be discussed in closed session because the drug has not yet received a positive opinion from the CHMP.
- 8. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Ms Angela Stainthorpe, Mr Tosin Lambe, Mr Nigel Fleeman, Dr James Larkin, Dr Philip Savage, Mrs Lucy Willingale and Professor Peter Clark to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
- 9. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bristol-Myer Squibb to the meeting.
- 10. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 10.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Mr Mark Chapman, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182].
 - 10.2. Dr Nicholas Latimer declared before the meeting that he has received consultancy fees from Bristol-Myers Squibb in relation to nivolumab (though not in this indication).
 - 10.2.1. It was agreed that Dr Latimer would not participate in this section of the meeting.
- 11. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 11.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182].

- 12. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 12.1. Ms Angela Stainthorpe, Mr Tosin Lambe, Mr Nigel Fleeman, , Mrs Lucy Willingale and Professor Peter Clark declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182].
 - 12.2. Dr James Larkin declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received research funding and consultancy fees from Bristol-Myers Squibb.
 - 12.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Larkin from participating in this section of the meeting
 - 12.3. Dr Philip Savage declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received speaker fees and travel expenses from the company and from comparator companies.
 - 12.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Savage from participating in this section of the meeting
- 13. The Chair introduced the lead team, Mr Diar Fattah, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182].
- 14. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
- 15. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 - Closed session

- 16. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
- 17. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
- 18. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of nivolumab with ipilimumab for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1182].
 - 18.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
- 19. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208]

- 20. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Philip Savage, Mrs Lucy Willingale, Professor Peter Clark, Dr Jonathan Shepherd, Professor Joanne Lord and Mr Olu Onyimadu to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
- 21. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Ipsen to the meeting.
- 22. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 22.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Mr Mark Chapman, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
 - 22.2. Dr Nicholas Latimer declared that he had received consultancy fees from Pfizer relating to other disease areas and was a member of Pfizer's global modelling committee between January 2017 and December 2017. 22.2.1. It was agreed that as this declaration did not relate to a specific comparator product Dr Latimer could participate in this section of the meeting.
- 23. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 23.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
- 24. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 24.1. Mrs Lucy Willingale, Professor Peter Clark, Dr Jonathan Shepherd, Professor Joanne Lord and Mr Olu Onyimadu declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
 - 24.2. Dr Philip Savage declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received speaker fees and travel expenses from the company and from comparator companies. Dr Savage also holds a small number of shares in Ipsen (less than £5,000).
 - 24.2.1. It was agreed that these declarations would not prevent Dr Savage from participating in this section of the meeting

- 25. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
- 26. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
- 27. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
- 28. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 - Closed session

- 29. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
- 30. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
- 31. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
 - 31.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
- 32. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945]

- 33. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Peter Clark, Professor Noel Clarke, Professor Nicholas James, Dr Julia Murray, Ms Emma Craske, Mr Brian Davies, Dr Miriam Brazzelli and Dr Ewen Cummins to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
- 34. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Janssen to the meeting.
- 35. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 35.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Mr Mark Chapman, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial

interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].

- 35.2. Dr Nicholas Latimer declared that he had received a consultancy fee from Janssen for providing a half-day training course on survival analysis. He also declared that he had received a consultancy fee from Astra Zeneca for giving advice on survival modelling for durvalumab as a monotherapy among patients with stage IIIB–IV NSCLC.
 - 35.2.1. It was agreed that as this declaration did not relate to the intervention product or to a specific comparator product Dr Latimer could participate in this section of the meeting.
- 35.3. Professor Stephen Palmer declared that he had received a consultancy fee from Takeda in connection with brigatinib for NSCLC.
 - 35.3.1. Takeda make leuprorelin, an androgen deprivation therapy and the intervention (abiraterone) and comparators are all taken with androgen deprivation therapy so the use of androgen deprivation therapy remains the same regardless of the recommendation for abiraterone. It was therefore agreed that Professor Palmer could participate in this section of the meeting.
- 36. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 36.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
- 37. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 37.1. Professor Peter Clark, Dr Julia Murray, Ms Emma Craske, Mr Brian Davies, Dr Miriam Brazzelli and Dr Ewen Cummins declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
 - 37.2. Professor Noel Clarke declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received speaker fees, honoraria and travel expenses from Janssen and other pharmaceutical companies involved in this area.
 37.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Clarke from participating in this section of the meeting
 - 37.3. Professor Nicholas James declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received speaker, consultancy fees and travel expenses from Janssen and from Sanofi. Professor Clarke also stated that he is chief

investigator for the STAMPEDE trial and lead investigator for the recently reported abiraterone comparison.

- 37.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor James from participating in this section of the meeting
- 38. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Mr William Turner and Mr Nigel Westwood who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormonenaive prostate cancer [ID945].
- 39. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
- 40. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
- 41. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 - Closed session

- 42. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
- 43. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
- 44. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
 - 44.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
- 45. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048]

- 46. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Graham Scotland and Dr Rodolfo Hernandez to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
- 47. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Sanofi to the meeting.
- 48. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 48.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Mr Mark Chapman, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Dr

Nicholas Latimer, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].

- 49. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 49.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
- 50. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 50.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
- 51. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
- 52. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
- 53. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
- 54. The Chair then thanked the experts, Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 - Closed session

- 55. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
 - 55.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

56. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937]

- 57. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Jo Lord and Dr Geoff Frampton to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
- 58. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Roche to the meeting.
- 59. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 59.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Mr Mark Chapman, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
- 60. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 60.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
- 61. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 61.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
- 62. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
- 63. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
- 64. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be

- prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
- 65. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 - Closed session

- 66. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
- 67. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
- 68. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
 - 68.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
- 69. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

Wednesday 6 June 2018 at 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU.