

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 6 March 2018, from 10am to 5pm

Venue: Prospero House
241 Borough High Street
London
SE1 1GA

Present:	1. Dr Amanda Adler	Present for all notes, Chair for notes 1 to 43
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel	Present for all notes, Chair for note 44 to 49
	3. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	4. Mr Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	5. Mr Diar Fattah	Present for all notes
	6. Ms Susan Faulds	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Mark Glover	Present for notes 1 to 39
	8. Mr Richard Hoddes	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Nicholas Latimer	Present for all notes
	10. Mr Christopher O'Regan	Present for notes 1 to 43
	11. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for all notes
	12. Dr Danielle Preedy	Present for all notes
	13. Dr Stephen Smith	Present for all notes
	14. Mr William Turner	Present for all notes
	15. Dr Nicky Welton	Present for all notes
	16. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for all notes
	17. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for 1 to 17 and note 44 to 49
Dr Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Sandra Aleknavice	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes

Jessica Maloney	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 19
Frances Nixon	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 19
Sharlene Ting	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 20 to 43
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 20 to 49
Alan Lamb	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 30
Orsolya Balogh	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 44 to 49
Ian Watson	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 44 to 49
Dr Geoff Frampton	Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 1 to 17
Professor Jo Lord	Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 1 to 17
Mrs Helen Goodman	Patient expert, nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 6 to 15
Mrs Evelyn King	Patient expert, nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 6 to 15
Dr Helen Ford	Clinical Expert, Consultant Neurologist, Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust, nominated by Novartis	Present for notes 6 to 15
Dr David Hunt	Clinical Expert, Honorary Consultant Neurologist and Wellcome Trust	Present for notes 6 to 15

Mr Malcolm Qualie	Clinician Scientist, Anne Rowling Clinic, University of Edinburgh, nominated by the MS Society Pharmacy Lead, NHS England, nominated by NHS England	Present for notes 6 to 15
Dr David Cooper	Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 20 to 28
Mr Rodolfo Hernandez	Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 20 to 28
Dr Graham Scotland	Senior Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 20 to 28
Raegan Chambers	Patient expert, nominated by Allergy UK	Present for notes 20 to 28
Dr Michael Ardern-Jones	Clinical expert, Academic Consultant Dermatologist, University Of Southampton, nominated by the BAD	Present for notes 20 to 28
Professor Catherine Smith	Clinical expert, Professor of Dermatology & Therapeutics, Guys and St Thomas', nominated by the BAD	Present for notes 20 to 28
Dr Richard Weller	Clinical expert, Reader and Honorary Consultant, University of Edinburgh and NHS Lothian, nominated by the BAD	Present for notes 20 to 28
Dr Xavier Armoiry	Senior Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 31 to 41
Mr Peter Auguste	Research Fellow in Medical Statistics and Epidemiology / Health Economist, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 31 to 41
Professor Aileen Clarke	Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 31 to 41
Non-public attendees:		
Lorna Dunning	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for all notes
Heidi Livingstone	Public Involvement Programme Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 30
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 43

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937], dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048], beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809], guselkumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID1075].
2. The Chair welcomed Dr Nicholas Latimer to the Committee and welcomed Mr William Turner to his first meeting as a member of this Appraisal Committee.
3. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Heidi Livingstone and Edgar Masanga
4. Apologies were received from Dr Mona Johnson, Dr Sanjay Kinra and Professor Sarah Wild.

Any other Business

5. The Committee were given an update on other appraisals considered at previously meetings.

Notes from the last meeting

6. The minutes of the Committee meeting held on 1 February were approved.

Appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937]

Part 1 – Open session

7. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Helen Ford, Dr Geoff Frampton, Mrs Helen Goodman, Dr David Hunt, Mrs Evelyn King, Professor Jo Lord and Mr Malcolm Qualie to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
8. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Roche to the meeting.
9. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 9.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
 - 9.2. Dr Nicholas Latimer declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has provided a training course on treatment switching methods for

Merck. Merck also funded the University of Sheffield to analyse the pivotal trial of cladribine for Multiple Sclerosis. Dr Latimer was on the project team.

9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Latimer from participating in this appraisal.

10. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 10.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
11. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 11.1. Dr Helen Ford, Dr Geoff Frampton, Dr David Hunt, Professor Jo Lord and Mr Malcolm Qualie declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
 - 11.2. Mrs Helen Goodman declared a personal non-specific financial interest as she is a non-executive director of Healthwatch South-West..
 - 11.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration did not constitute a conflict of interest.
 - 11.3. Mrs Evelyn King declared a personal non-specific financial interest as she has received travel expenses to speak at a conference for Roche.
 - 11.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mrs King from participating in this section of the meeting
12. The Chair introduced the lead team, Mr Richard Hoddes, Mr Nigel Westwood and Mr Mark Chapman who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
13. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
14. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
15. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

16. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
17. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
18. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating relapsing multiple sclerosis [ID937].
 - 18.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
19. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048]

Part 1 – Open session

20. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Michael Ardern-Jones, Raegan Chambers, Dr David Cooper, Mr Rodolfo Hernandez, Dr Graham Scotland, Professor Catherine Smith and Dr Richard Weller to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
21. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Sanofi to the meeting.
22. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 22.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
23. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 23.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
24. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

- 24.1. Raegan Chambers, Dr David Cooper, Mr Rodolfo Hernandez, Dr Graham Scotland, Professor Catherine Smith and Dr Richard Weller declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
- 24.2. Dr Michael Ardern-Jones declared a personal specific non-financial interest as he has worked in a non-paid role with Sanofi on research projects.
 - 24.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Ardern-Jones from participating in this section of the meeting
25. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Stephen Smith, Dr Dani Preedy and Mr Diar Fattah who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
26. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
27. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
28. The Chair then thanked the experts, Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of dupilumab for treating moderate to severe atopic dermatitis after topical treatments [ID1048].
 - 29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809]

Part 1 – Open session

31. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Xavier Armoiry, Mr Peter Auguste and Professor Aileen Clarke to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
32. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Biogen, Merck, Novartis and Teva to the meeting.

33. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
- 33.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
- 33.2. Dr Nicholas Latimer declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has provided a training course on treatment switching methods for Merck. Merck also funded the University of Sheffield to analyse the pivotal trial of cladribine for Multiple Sclerosis. Dr Latimer was on the project team.
- 33.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Latimer from participating in this appraisal.
34. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 34.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
35. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
- 35.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
36. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
37. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
38. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to

Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

39. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

40. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the companies.
41. The Chair then thanked the Assessment Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
42. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
 - 42.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
43. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of guselkumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID1075]

Part 2 – Closed session

44. The Vice-Chair explained to the Committee that this discussion followed on from the part 2 (closed session) discussion at the previous Committee meeting. Therefore no Evidence Review Group or company representatives had been invited.
45. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 45.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of guselkumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID1075].
 - 45.2. Mr Christopher O'Regan declared a personal specific financial interest before the meeting and did not participate. Mr O'Regan is employed by Merck Sharp and Dohme.
46. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 46.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the

technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of guselkumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID1075].

47. The Chair introduced the additional information submitted since the previous Committee meeting.
48. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of guselkumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID1075].
 - 48.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
49. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

Thursday 10 May 2018, from 10am to 6pm at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU.