

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** Wednesday 6 June 2018, 10am to 5.30pm

**Venue:** 10 Spring Gardens  
London  
SW1A 2BU

<b>Present:</b>	1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair)	Present for all notes
	3. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	4. Mr David Chandler	Present for all notes
	5. Mr Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	6. Mr Diar Fattah	Present for all notes
	7. Ms Susan Faulds	Present for all notes
	8. Mr Richard Hoddes	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Mona Johnson	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	11. Mr Chris O'Regan	Present for all notes
	12. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for notes 18 to 42
	13. Professor Sarah Wild	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes

### In attendance:

Melinda Goodall	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Sandra Aleknavice	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Mary Hughes	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17

Thomas Walker	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 30
Rebecca Albrow	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 30
Sharlene Ting	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 31 to 42
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 31 to 42
Professor Joanne Lord	Director, Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Jo Picot	Senior Research Fellow, Southampton Health Technology Assessment Centre	Present for notes 1 to 15
Professor Peter Clark	Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF	Present for notes 1 to 17
Professor Graham Jackson	Professor of Clinical Haematology, Newcastle Upon Tyne Hospitals Trust, clinical expert nominated by Janssen	Present for notes 5 to 13
Dr Matthew Streetly	Consultant Haematologist, Guys and St. Thomas' NHS Foundation Trust, clinical expert nominated by the UKMF	Present for notes 5 to 13
Mrs Carmen Lester	Patient expert nominated by Myeloma UK	Present for notes 5 to 13
Ms Shelagh McKinlay	Head of Patient Advocacy, Myeloma UK, patient expert nominated by Myeloma UK	Present for notes 5 to 13
Dr Xavier Armoiry	Senior Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 18 to 28
Mr Peter Auguste	Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 18 to 28
Dr Peter Brex	Consultant Neurologist, King's College Hospital	Present for notes 18 to 26

Dr Alistair Coles	NHS Foundation Trust, clinical expert nominated by the MS Trust Prof of Neuroimmunology and Consultant Neurologist, University of Cambridge, clinical expert nominated by the ABN	Present for notes 18 to 26
Mr Craig Milverton	Patient expert nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 18 to 26
Mrs Yvonne Pettigrew	Patient expert nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 18 to 26
Mr Malcolm Qualie	Pharmacy Lead NHS England, NHS Commissioning expert nominated by NHS England	Present for notes 18 to 28
Mr Dwayne Boyers	Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 31 to 39
Miss Maria Dimitrova	Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 31 to 39
Mr Dolapo Ayansina	Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 31 to 39
Professor Mark Emberton	Dean Faculty of Medical Sciences, University College London, clinical expert nominated by Steba Biotech	Present for notes 31 to 39
Miss Caroline Moore	Consultant Urological Surgeon, University College London, clinical expert nominated by the BAUS	Present for notes 31 to 39

#### **Non-public attendees:**

Helen Barnett	Medical Editor, NICE	Present for all notes
Adam Brooke	Technical Analyst, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 39
Ross Dent	Technical Adviser, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 39
Marcela Haasova	Technical Analyst, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 17
Chloe Kastoryano	Public Involvement Programme Adviser, NICE	Present for all notes
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, NICE	Present for all notes

## **Notes**

### **Welcome**

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974], ocrelizumab for treating

primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938] and padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Helen Barnett, Adam Brooke, Ross Dent, Marcela Haasova, Chloe Kastoryano and Edgar Masanga.
3. Apologies were received from Dr Mark Glover, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton and Mr Nigel Westwood.

### **Any other Business**

4. The Committee were given an update on the progress of other appraisals previously seen by the Committee and an update on personnel changes within the NICE Technology Appraisals team.

### **Appraisal of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974]**

#### **Part 1 – Open session**

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Joanne Lord, Dr Jo Picot, Professor Peter Clark, Professor Graham Jackson, Dr Matthew Streetly, Mrs Carmen Lester and Ms Shelagh McKinlay to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Janssen to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.
  - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Chris O'Regan, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974].
  - 7.2. Professor Stephen Palmer declared a non-personal specific financial interest before the meeting as he has received consultancy fees from Amgen for general technical advice.
    - 9.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would prevent Professor Palmer from participating in this section of the meeting.
8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daratumumab in

combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974].

9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 9.1. Professor Joanne Lord, Dr Jo Picot, Professor Peter Clark, Mrs Carmen Lester and Dr Matthew Streetly declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974].
  - 9.2. Professor Graham Jackson declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received speaker fees from Janssen and from other pharmaceutical companies involved in this area.
    - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Jackson from participating in this section of the meeting.
  - 9.3. Ms Shelagh McKinlay declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as Myeloma UK receives 12% of its funding from pharmaceutical companies.
    - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ms McKinlay from participating in this section of the meeting.
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Ms Susan Faulds and Mr Christopher O'Regan who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of daratumumab in combination with bortezomib for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma [ID974].
  - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

18. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Xavier Armoiry, Mr Peter Auguste, Dr Peter Brex, Dr Alistair Coles, Mr Craig Milverton, Mrs Yvonne Pettigrew and Mr Malcolm Qualie to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Roche to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.
  - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Chris O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 22.1. Dr Xavier Armoiry, Mr Peter Auguste, Mr Craig Milverton, Mrs Yvonne Pettigrew and Mr Malcolm Qualie declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].

- 22.2. Dr Peter Brex declared a personal specific financial interest as he has undertaken consultancy work for Roche and other pharmaceutical companies.  
22.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Brex from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 22.3. Dr Alistair Coles declared a personal non specific financial interest as he has received payments from Genzyme.  
22.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Coles from participating in this section of the meeting.
23. The Chair introduced the lead team, Mr David Chandler, Mr Richard Hoddes and Dr Sanjeev Patel who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
26. The Chair then thanked the clinical and patient experts for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives and Mr Malcolm Qualie for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].  
29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

31. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr Dwayne Boyers, Miss Maria Dimitrova, Mr Dolapo Ayansina, Professor Mark Emberton and Miss Caroline Moore to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
32. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Steba Biotech to the meeting.

33. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.
- 33.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Mona Johnson, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Chris O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
34. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 34.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
35. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
- 35.1. Mr Dwayne Boyers, Miss Maria Dimitrova and Mr Dolapo Ayansina declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
- 35.2. Professor Mark Emberton declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received meeting expenses from Steba Biotech and participated in advisory boards for Steba Biotech.
- 35.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Emberton from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 35.3. Miss Caroline Moore declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received meeting expenses from Steba Biotech and participated in advisory boards for Steba Biotech.
- 35.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Miss Moore from participating in this section of the meeting.
36. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor John Cairns and Professor Sarah Wild who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
37. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
38. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to



Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

39. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

40. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
41. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
  - 41.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
42. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## **Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

Tuesday 10 July 2018 at 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU.