

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** Thursday 4 January 2018, from 10am to 5pm

**Venue:** Prospero House  
241 Borough High Street  
London  
SE1 1GA

<b>Present:</b>	1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel	Present for all notes
	3. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	4. Mr David Chandler	Present for notes 18 to 44 as a Committee member
	5. Mr Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	6. Mr Diar Fattah	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Mark Glover	Present for all notes
	8. Mr Richard James Hoddes	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Richard Nicholas	Present for all notes
	11. Mr Christopher O'Regan	Present for notes 18 to 36
	12. Dr Danielle Preedy	Present for all notes
	13. Mrs Pamela Rees	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Stephen Smith	Present for all notes
	15. Dr Nicky Welton	Present for all notes

### In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Mandy Tonkinson	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for	Present for notes 1 to 17 and notes 37 to 44

	Health and Clinical Excellence	
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 36
Boglarka Mikudina	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 29
Lucy Beggs	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 30 to 36
Mr Alessandro Grosso	NIHR Research Methods Fellow, Centre for Health Economics, University of York	Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Claire Rothery	Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Health Economics, University of York	Present for notes 1 to 15
Ms Ros Wade	Research Fellow, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York	Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Anthony Bewley	Consultant Dermatologist, Barts Health NHS Trust – clinical expert, nominated by Leo Pharma	Present for notes 1 to 13
Mrs Carolyn Saunders	Dermatology Clinical Nurse Specialist – clinical expert, nominated by British Dermatological Nursing Group (BDNG)	Present for notes 1 to 13
Mrs Helen McAteer	Chief Executive, Psoriasis Association – patient expert, nominated by Psoriasis Association	Present for notes 1 to 13
Mr David Chandler	Chief Executive, Psoriasis and Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance – patient expert, nominated by Psoriasis and Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance	Present for notes 1 to 13 (as a patient expert)
Dr Graham Scotland	Senior Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 18 to 26
Dr Jonathan Hind	Consultant in Paediatric Hepatology, Kings College Hospital – clinical expert, nominated	Present for notes 18 to 26

Professor Peter Clark	by Shire Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF	Present for notes 30 to 44
-----------------------	---	----------------------------

**Non-public attendees:**

Sandra Aleknavice	Administrator, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 29
Helen Barnett	Senior Medical Editor, NICE	Present for all notes
Dr Sofia Dias	Senior Research Fellow, Bristol Medical School	Present for all notes
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, NICE	Present for all notes
Dr Laetitia Schmitt	Centre for Health Economics, University of York	Present for notes 1 to 17
Ms Emily South	Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York	Present for notes 1 to 17

**Notes**

**Welcome**

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878], teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885], obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020] and tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Sandra Aleknavice, Helen Barnett, Dr Sofia Dias, Edgar Masanga, Dr Laetitia Schmitt and Ms Emily South.
3. Apologies were received from Mrs Susan Faulds, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stuart Williams and Mr Nigel Westwood.

**Any other Business**

4. The Committee were given an update on the expected timelines for other appraisals.

**Appraisal of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878]**

**Part 1 – Open session**

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr Alessandro Grosso, Dr Claire Rothery, Ms Ros Wade, Dr Anthony Bewley, Mrs Carolyn Saunders, Mrs Helen McAteer and Mr David Chandler to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Leo Pharma to the meeting.

7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Richard Nicholas, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Dr Danielle Preedy, Mrs Pamela Rees, Dr Stephen Smith and Dr Nicky Welton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878].
  - 7.2. Dr Richard Nicholas declared a personal non-specific non-financial interest as he has written paper with members of Novartis economics team in Multiple Sclerosis published in J Med Economics 2017.
    - 9.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Nicholas from participating in this section of the meeting.
  - 7.3. Mr Christopher O'Regan declared a personal pecuniary conflict before the meeting as he is employed by Merck Sharp and Dohme. It was agreed that Mr O'Regan would not take part in this appraisal.
8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878].
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 9.1. Mr Alessandro Grosso, Dr Claire Rothery, Ms Ros Wade, Mrs Carolyn Saunders, Mrs Helen McAteer and Mr David Chandler declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878].
  - 9.2. Dr Anthony Bewley declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he has worked on ad hoc consultancies with a number of pharmaceutical companies, including Leo Pharma.
    - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Bewley from participating in this section of the meeting
  - 9.3. Mrs Helen McAteer declared a personal specific financial interest as the Psoriasis Association has six corporate members, including Leo Pharma.
    - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mrs McAteer from participating in this section of the meeting

10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Stephen Smith, Dr Danielle Preedy and Mr Mark Chapman who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Evidence Review Group representatives left the meeting.
16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of brodalumab for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID878].
  - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

18. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Graham Scotland and Dr Jonathan Hind to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Shire to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Richard Nicholas, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Dr Danielle Preedy, Mrs Pamela Rees, Dr Stephen Smith and Dr Nicky Welton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885].

21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 22.1. Dr Graham Scotland declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885].
  - 22.2. Dr Jonathan Hind declared a personal specific financial interest as he has served on an advisory board for Shire and received funding to attend a conference.
    - 22.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Hind from participating in this section of the meeting
23. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
26. The Chair then thanked the expert, Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
28. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of teduglutide for treating short bowel syndrome [ID885].
  - 28.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
29. The Committee agreed to defer a decision on the content of the guidance section of the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) until further analysis had been undertaken.

## **Appraisal of obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020]**

### **Part 2 – closed session**

30. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Professor Peter Clark to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.
31. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 31.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Richard Nicholas, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Dr Danielle Preedy, Mrs Pamela Rees, Dr Stephen Smith and Dr Nicky Welton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020].
32. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 32.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020].
33. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 33.1. Professor Peter Clark declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020].
34. The Chair presented the additional information submitted by the company since the last Committee meeting.
35. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of obinutuzumab for untreated advanced follicular lymphoma [ID1020].
  - 35.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
36. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591]**

### **Part 2 – closed session**

37. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Professor Peter Clark to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.
38. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 38.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Mr Diar Fattah, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Richard Nicholas, Dr Danielle Preedy, Mrs Pamela Rees, Dr Stephen Smith and Dr Nicky Welton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
39. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 39.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
40. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 40.1. Professor Peter Clark declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
41. The Chair presented the additional information submitted by the company since the last Committee meeting.
42. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
  - 42.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
43. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

#### **Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

44. Thursday 1 February 2018 at 10am to 5pm Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London SE1 1GA