

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee A)

Minutes: [Confirmed]

Date and Time: Tuesday 16 January 2018

Venue: Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, SE1 1GA

Present:	1. Chair Jane Adam	Present for all notes
	2. Professor Iain Squire	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Graham Ash	Present for all notes
	4. Dr Jeremy Braybrooke	Present for all notes
	5. Dr Justin Daniels	Present for all notes
	6. Dr Rachel Hobson	Present for all notes
	7. Professor John McMurray	Present for notes 7 to 39
	8. Dr Mohit Sharma	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Ian Bernstein	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Minal Bikhai	Present for all notes
	11. Mrs Pamela Rees	Present for all notes
	12. Mrs Ellen Rule	Present for all notes
	13. Mr Stephen Sharp	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Brian Shine	Present for all notes
	15. Mr David Evans	Present for all notes
	16. Dr John Watkins	Present for all notes
	17. Professor Olivia Wu	Present for all notes
	18. Dr Nery Woolacott	Present for notes 7 to 39
	19. Dr Rita Faria	Present for notes 7 to 39

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Janet Robertson	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Thomas Feist	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Marcia Miller	Technology Appraisal Administrator, National Institute for Health and	Present for all notes

Care Excellence

Irina Voicechovskaja	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Zoe Charles	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Marcela Haasova	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 27
Joanna Richardson	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 27
Eleanor Donegan	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 39

NHS England

Peter Clark	NHS England, Clinical Expert	Present for all notes
-------------	---------------------------------	-----------------------

Evidence Review Group

Dr Steve Edwards	BMJ-TAG	Present for notes 1 to 13 & 18 to 24
Tracey Jhita	BMJ-TAG	Present for notes 1 to 13
Charlotta Karner	BMJ-TAG	Present for notes 1 to 13
Victoria Wakefield	BMJ-TAG	Present for notes 18 to 24
Peter Cain	BMJ-TAG	Present for notes 18 to 24
Adrian Bagust	Liverpool Reviews Implementation Group (LriG)	Present for notes 28 to 36

Nigel Fleeman	Liverpool Reviews Implementation Group (LriG)	Present for notes 28 to 36
---------------	---	----------------------------

Clinical Experts

Dr Andrew Clamp	Consultant and Senior Lecturer in Medical Oncology	Present for notes 1 to 13
-----------------	--	---------------------------

Dr Sarah Williams	Consultant Medical Oncologist	Present for notes 1 to 13
-------------------	-------------------------------	---------------------------

Dr Guy Faust	Consultant Medical Oncologist	Present for notes 18 to 24
--------------	-------------------------------	----------------------------

Patient expert

Dr Hilary Morrison	Retired GP	Present for notes 1 to 13
--------------------	------------	---------------------------

Ms Rebecca Rennison	Director of Public Affairs and Services	Present for notes 1 to 13
---------------------	---	---------------------------

Non-public attendees:

Ana Uribe-Echeverry	NICE, Corporate Office	Present for all notes
Henry Edwards	NICE, CDF Team	Present for notes 1 to 27
Heidi Livingstone	NICE, PPIP	Present for notes 1 to 17
Emma Kent	NICE	Present for notes 18 to 27
Adam Storrow	NICE	Present for all notes
Michael Wallington	PHE National Cancer Registration and Analysis Service	Present for notes 1 to 39
Catherine Thomson	PHE National Cancer Registration and Analysis Service	Present for all notes 1 to 39
Frances Adlam	NICE, Press Office	Present for notes 1 to 17

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer [ID1041]
2. The Chair informed the Committee there were non-public observers present.
3. Apologies were received from Mrs Sarah Parry.

Notes from the last meeting

4. Minutes of the last meeting were agreed.

Appraisal of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer [ID1041]

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Andrew Clamp, Dr Steve Edwards, Tracey Jhita, Charlotte Karner, Hilary Morrison, Rebecca Rennison and Dr Sarah Williams to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Tesaro to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 7.1. Dr Jane Adam, Professor Iain Squire, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Minal Bakhai, Dr Justin Daniels, Mr David Evans, Dr Rita Faria, Dr Rachel Hobson, Professor John McMurray, Dr Mohit Sharma, Dr Ian Bernstein, Ms Pamela Rees, Ms Ellen Rule, Mr Stephen Sharp, Dr Brain Shine, Dr John Watkins, Professor Olivia Wu, Dr Nerys Woolacott and Mr Stephen Sharp all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer

- 7.2. Dr Jeremy Braybrooke, non- personal specific financial interest as he is co-investigator on a clinical trial in breast cancer with a comparator, olaparib.
- 7.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Jeremy Braybrooke from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 7.3. Mr Adrian Griffith declared a personal specific financial interest as his employer Janssen (owned by J&J) has a global collaboration agreement with Tesaro for Niraparib in prostate cancer (but not ovarian cancer).
- 7.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would prevent Mr Adrian G Griffin from participating I this section of the meeting and he remained absent from the meeting.
- 7.4. Dr Paul Robinson declared a personal specific financial interest as his employer, MSD, has entered into a collaboration with AstraZeneca to co-develop olaparib, the comparator agent
- 7.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would prevent Dr Paul Robinson from participating in this section of the meeting and he remained absent from the meeting.
8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
- 9.1. Dr Steve Edwards, Tracey Jhita, Charlotte Karner, Hilary Morrison and Rebecca Rennison declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer
- 9.2. Dr Andrew Clamp declared a personal specific financial interest as he has been paid for advisory boards, research funding by AstraZeneca and conducted clinical trials of PARP inhibitors sponsored by AstraZeneca, comparator manufacturer for this appraisal.
- 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Andrew Clamp from participating in this section of the meeting
- 9.3. Dr Sarah Williams declared a personal specific financial interest as she been paid for attending an advisory board hosted by Tesaro in March 2017. She has also has been a co-investigator in he NOVA study, she

has been a co-investigator in Olaparib studies in ovarian cancer and has received conference funding from AstraZeneca

10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Jeremy Braybrooke, Pamela Rees and Ellen Rule who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Niraparib for maintenance treatment of relapsed, platinum-sensitive ovarian, fallopian tube and peritoneal cancer.
16. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of Avelumab for treating metastatic Merkel cell carcinoma [ID1102]

Part 1 – Open session

18. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Steve Edwards, Dr Guy Faust Peter Cain and Victoria Wakefield to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Merck to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 20.1. Dr Jane Adam, Professor Iain Squire, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Minal Bakhai, Dr Jeremy Braybrooke, Dr Justin Daniels, Mr David Evans, Dr Rita Faria, Dr Rachel Hobson, Professor John McMurray, Dr Mohit Sharma, Dr Ian Bernstein, Ms Pamela Rees, Ms Ellen Rule, Mr Stephen Sharp, Dr Brain Shine, Dr John Watkins, Professor Olivia Wu, Dr Nerys Woolacott and Mr Stephen Sharp all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Appraisal of Avelumab for treating metastatic Merkel cell carcinoma.
 - 20.2. Dr Paul Robinson declared a personal specific financial interest as his his employer, MSD, has entered a phase III data with pembrolizumab in merkle cell carcinoma, so although not listed as a comparator, he made the decision to remain absent from the meeting.
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Avelumab for treating metastatic Merkel cell carcinoma
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 22.1. Dr Steve Edwards, Peter Cain, Victoria Wakefield and Dr Guy Faust declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the

technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Avelumab for treating metastatic Merkel cell carcinoma.

- 22.2. Dr Guy Faust declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he is a clinical expert consultant medical oncologist.
22.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Guy Faust from participating in this section of the meeting

22. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
23. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
24. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
25. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

26. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
27. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Avelumab for treating metastatic Merkel cell carcinoma.
- 27.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
28. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD)] in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of Eribulin for treating locally advanced or metastatic breast cancer after 1 chemotherapy regimen [ID1072]

Part 1 – Open session

28. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Adrian Bagust and Nigel Fleeman to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
29. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Eisai to the meeting.
30. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 30.1. Dr Jane Adam, Professor Iain Squire, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Minal Bakhai, Dr Jeremy Braybrooke, Dr Justin Daniels, Mr David Evans, Dr Rita Faria, Dr Rachel Hobson, Professor John McMurray, Dr Mohit Sharma, Dr Ian Bernstein, Ms Pamela Rees, Ms Ellen Rule, Mr Stephen Sharp, Dr Brain Shine, Dr John Watkins, Professor Olivia Wu, Dr Nerys Woolacott and Mr Stephen Sharp all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Appraisal of Eribulin for treating locally advanced or metastatic breast cancer after 1 chemotherapy regimen.
31. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 31.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Eribulin for treating locally advanced or metastatic breast cancer after 1 chemotherapy regimen.
32. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 32.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Eribulin for treating locally advanced or metastatic breast cancer after 1 chemotherapy regimen
33. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

34. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
35. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
36. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

37. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
38. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Eribulin for treating locally advanced or metastatic breast cancer after 1 chemotherapy regimen.
 - 38.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
39. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD)] in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

40. Tuesday 13 February 2018, 10am at Prospero House, 241 Borough High Road, SE1 1GA